Perspectives on Transforming Doctoral Education
Lessons Learned from the CID

The Carnegie Initiative on the Doctorate (CID) was a five-year partnership with 106 doctoral-granting departments/programs, encompassing six disciplines: chemistry, education, English, history, mathematics and neuroscience.
The CID team included:
• George E. Walker, Project Director
• Chris M. Golde, Research Director
• Laura Jones
• Andrea Conklin Bueschel
• Pat Hutchings
Motivation

- Cross purposes
- Uneven mentoring
- Attrition
- Time to degree
- Diversity
- Pedagogy of research
- Multidisciplinary experiences
- “Real world” effectiveness
Approach

1. Engage departments in a process of self-discovery about their doctoral program.

2. Work at the department (program) level.
3. Graduate student and critical mass of faculty engaged for 3 to 5 years—departmental and university engagement.

4. Essays, site visits, Carnegie convening's, surveys, interviews.

5. Stewards of the Discipline-P.A.R.T.
Characteristics of CID

6. Accountability—programs decide what they need to do, do it, tell others, and evaluate.

7. Accountability—engage in critical self-examination publicly, work with “critical friends”.

8. Develop a vision regarding the doctoral program, and work to make the vision a reality.

9. Develop individuals who will be scholar-practitioners and “stewards of their discipline”.

George Walker
April 2012
Elaboration of Scholarly Formation
A Steward of the Discipline

Generate and Evaluate Knowledge: Stewards are able to generate and critically evaluate new knowledge. Empowered by an understanding of existing theories and practice, scholars create new ideas and theories, and evidence to add to the body of knowledge.
Conserve Knowledge: Scholars become familiar with “knowledge” in their area of expertise and identify the most useful to their discipline, setting and institution; analyzing and applying relevant ideas to meaningful situations. Using and teaching these ideas ensures the conservation of knowledge.

Transform Knowledge: Scholars use written and verbal communication to display competence as leaders, sharing their knowledge in a variety of settings through continued research, writing, teaching, consulting, and commercialization.
Main Recurring Themes

• Scholarly Integration
• Intellectual Community
• Apprenticeship

Scholarship segregated is scholarship impoverished

George Walker
April 2012
Scholarly Integration

• Principles of student formation:
  ➢ Progressive development
    (Early grounding in applied or clinical studies if appropriate)
  ➢ Integrative learning
    (Theory ↔ Practice)
  ➢ Collaborative learning
    (Use of collaboratories + across disciplinary boundaries)
  ➢ Learning from Failure
    (see intellectual community)
Intellectual Community

• What is intellectual community?
• Why is it important?
• How to foster intellectual community?
Apprenticeship

• Students should not be apprenticed to a faculty mentor; they should apprentice with several mentors.
• Multiple relationships are important.
• Requires respect, trust, reciprocity.
Passion to Learn
Learn to Learn
Confidence to Learn
Desire and Ability to Help Others Learn
Ability to Apply Learning

George Walker
April 2012
A Call to Action

• In general, programs do not have a clear nuanced set of purposes.

• The aims of doctoral programs are often not transparent to either faculty or students.

• Result—difficult to evaluate program progress or student development.
A Call to Action

• Students do not gain the judgment or experience to ask good research questions, become effective teachers or mentors, respond effectively to evolving practice experiences and external conditions.

• Assessment evidence and remedial action regarding the areas above are often lacking.

George Walker
April 2012
A Call to Action

- What can be done? (Local faculty and student engagement and self-evaluation).
- There is a clear need for scholarly formation evidence.
- More evidence based research is needed (The Pedagogy of Research).
A Call to Action

• Combination of faculty disciplinary leadership and administrative cooperation can be very helpful.

• The apprenticeship model should be imbedded in a robust, responsible, and purposeful intellectual community.

• Programs should be regularly self-studied to assess student outcomes.
Progress

Selected doctoral programs around the nation are using a one year “CID-inspired” self-study to improve.

Advantages

Funding, Faculty Hires, Student Enrollment and Successful lifelong Learning.